

AGENDA

Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board

Date: July 28, 2004
Time: 1:30 pm (EST)
Location: Indiana Government Training Center Rm. 2
402 W. Washington Street
Indianapolis, Indiana 46204

Call to Order

Approval of the April 28, 2004 meeting minutes

I. Division Director's Report

II. State Certificates of Approval

1. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of Engineering for a certificate of approval to alter the Indiana State Fairgrounds, in Indianapolis, Washington Township, Marion County, Indiana, by landscaping around the Department of Natural Resources building, reconstructing the fish ponds and walkways on the west side, construction of a pergola in the butterfly garden, and construction of a fishing pond and amphitheater on the north side.
2. Request by the Division of Indiana State Museums and Historic Sites for a certificate of approval for the stabilization of ceilings throughout the Culbertson Mansion at 914 East Main Street in New Albany, Floyd County, Indiana.
3. Request by the Indiana Department of Transportation for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Orr Iron Company building part of improvements to SR 62 (Lloyd Expressway) in Evansville, Vanderburgh County, Indiana.

III. State and National Register Applications

1. Simpson Memorial United Methodist Church, 043-237-00119, 9449 Harrison St., Greenville, Floyd County (1731)
2. Hillcrest Country Club, 049-295-00042, 6098 Fall Creek Rd., Indianapolis, Marion County (1758)
3. Goodland-Grant Township Public Library, 111 S. Newton St., Goodland, Newton County (1777)
4. Hall School, 109-258-20009, 5955 W. Hurt Rd., Monrovia, Morgan County (1780)
5. Millen House, 105-055-80021, 112 N. Bryan Ave., Bloomington, Monroe County (1782)

6. **Central Court Historic District, 098-296-04000, 3529-3575 Central Ct., 515-551 E. 36th Street, Indianapolis, Marion County (1785)**
7. **Louis J. Bailey Branch Library – Gary International Institute, 089-232-20577, 1501 W. Madison St. Gary, Lake County (1787)**

IV. Grant Evaluation Criteria and Priorities for FY 2005 Historic Preservation Fund Grants

V. Properties Listed in, Rejected by, or Removed from the National Register since the last Notification

Listed

Rivoli Theater, 098-295-01041, 3155 E. 10th Street, Indianapolis, Marion County (1378)

Union City Public Library, 135-636-37218, 408 N. Columbia Street, Union City, Randolph County (1733)

Thiebaud Farmstead, 531 S R 56, Vevay, Switzerland County (1766)

John W. McClain House, 063-514-45048, 1445 South C R 525 E, Avon, Hendricks County (1769)

John Fitch Hill House, 098-396-01854, 1523 Southeastern Ave., Indianapolis, Marion County (1771)

Oliver Johnson's Woods Historic District, 097-296-26000, Marion County (1772)

John and Dorothy Haynes House, 3901 N. Washington Rd., Ft. Wayne, Allen County (1778)

Rejected

none

Removed

Burton Lane Bridge, Burton Lane over Indian Creek, Martinsville vicinity, Morgan County
(demolished)

VI. Set date for the next meeting

Proposed date: October 21, 2004 , Indiana Government Conference Center Room A, 1:30 p.m. (EST)

TO: Members of the Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board

FROM: Jon Smith, Director, Division of Historic Preservation & Archaeology

DATE: July 9, 2004

SUBJECT: Staff comments for items on the July 28, 2004 agenda

II. State Certificates of Approval

- 1. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of Engineering for a certificate of approval to alter the Indiana State Fairgrounds, in Indianapolis, Washington Township, Marion County, Indiana, by landscaping around the Department of Natural Resources building, reconstructing the fish ponds and walkways on the west side, construction of a pergola in the butterfly garden, and construction of a fishing pond and amphitheater on the north side.**

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II-1. It consists of a letter dated April 30, 2004, from Matt Pore, on behalf of D. Craig Bair, Chief of Planning and Design, Division of Engineering, Indiana Department of Natural Resources, to Jon C. Smith, and a completed application for a certificate of approval. The form includes a narrative description of the scope of work, photographs of the Department of Natural Resources building, and construction plans. The letter and application were received on April 30, 2004.

The Department of Natural Resources building lies within the Indiana State Fairgrounds Historic District, which has been determined eligible for inclusion in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures for its historical and architectural significance. Because historic sites or structures owned by the state will be altered by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The scope of work entails 1) the reconstruction of the ponds on the west side of the building, including the replacement of water supply lines, valves, and drains, 2) the construction of a pergola in the butterfly garden to support a netting enclosure, 3) the construction of a fishing pond on the north side of the building, 4) the construction of an amphitheater on the north side of the building, 5) the replacement of pavement around the building, and 6) grade adjustments around the west and north porches to provide better accessibility.

The staff does not have any concerns or recommendations regarding the scope of work as currently proposed.

The Division of Historic Preservation and Archaeology staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.1 as its findings.

- 2. Request by the Division of Indiana State Museums and Historic Sites for a certificate of approval for the stabilization of ceilings throughout the Culbertson Mansion at 914 East Main Street in New Albany, Floyd County, Indiana.**

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II-2. It consists of a cover letter and completed form dated May 26, 2004, from Kathleen McLary to Jon Smith.

The Culbertson Mansion was identified in City of New Albany, Floyd County Interim Report, Indiana Survey of Historic Sites and Structures, and for the purposes of that survey, it was assigned site #043-446-13162. The shelter was given an "O - Outstanding" rating, and the building was listed in the National Register of Historic

Places as a contributing resource in the Mansion Row Historic District. Therefore, the Culbertson Mansion is historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18. Because a state agency is proposing the alteration of an historic structure, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The scope of work includes the removal, repair and cleaning of all ceiling enrichments, including egg and dart molding and medallions; the installation of a veneer plaster system over the existing plaster ceiling; replication of original decorative designs, colors, and finishes; and reinstallation of the ceiling enrichments for the second floor Stairway, Main Hall, Middle Bedroom, Front Bedroom and Private Parlor.

The DHPA staff considers the proposed changes to be acceptable and recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.2. as its findings.

3. Request by the Indiana Department of Transportation for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Orr Iron Company Building part of improvements to SR 62 (Lloyd Expressway) in Evansville, Vanderburgh County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II-3. It consists of a letter dated June 17, 2004, from historical consultant Dr. Linda Weintraut, on behalf of the Indiana Department of Transportation ("INDOT"), to Jon C. Smith and a completed application of the same date for a certificate of approval for the SR 62 Lloyd Expressway Improvement Project in Evansville, Vanderburgh County. The form includes a narrative description of the scope of work, a discussion of the impacts, photographs, and schematic construction drawings. The letter and application were both received on June 17, 2004.

The Orr Iron Company Building, which is proposed to be demolished in this project, was listed in the National Register of Historic Places on July 1, 1982, as part of the Downtown Evansville Multiple Resource Area. Consequently, it is appropriate that INDOT apply for a certificate of approval under IC 14-21-1-18 for the partly state-funded demolition of that historic and register-listed building.

The application does a good job of identifying historic properties within the vicinity of the project and of identifying others within the path of the project that are not historic. The DHPA staff agrees that the Orr Iron Building is the only historic structure whose integrity will be diminished by the SR 62 Lloyd Expressway Improvement Project.

As the application indicates, the DHPA staff has been actively involved in reviewing this project, on behalf of the State Historic Preservation Officer, under Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act, due to the proposed expenditure of funds from the Federal Highway Administration ("FHWA") in the project. While the prospect of losing an historic structure such as the Orr Iron Company Building is regrettable, the DHPA staff has concluded that there is no feasible way to avoid that loss. Avoidance of the 1912 Orr Iron Building would likely result in the loss of an even older historic structure, the ca. 1855 Canal House at 1119 West Indiana Street, and would raise the cost of the project immensely. Even moving the Orr Iron Building out of the path of the project would cost millions of dollars. Consequently, the DHPA staff recommends that a certificate of approval allowing the demolition of the Orr Iron Company Building be granted.

Consultation is currently underway among FHWA, INDOT, the City of Evansville's historic preservation officer, Historic Landmarks Foundation of Indiana, and the DHPA staff regarding the development of a Section 106 memorandum of agreement, which would conclude the federal Section 106 process and would stipulate various measures to mitigate the adverse effect that demolishing the Orr Iron Company Building would have. It is likely that the mitigation provided for in the memorandum of agreement would include at least photographic documentation of the Orr Iron Building prior to its demolition. Consequently, the DHPA staff is not recommending any other mitigation for the demolition of the building using, in part, state funds. The staff recommends, instead,

that the mitigation measures that ultimately are agreed upon in the Section 106 MOA satisfy any mitigation that the Review Board might otherwise ask INDOT to provide as a condition to the granting of the certificate of approval.

The DHPA staff recommends that, in the event that the Review Board takes action on this certificate of approval application, it adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.3 as its findings.

III. State and National Register Applications

1. Simpson Memorial United Methodist Church, 043-237-00119, 9449 Harrison St., Greenville, Floyd County (1731)

The 1978 Floyd County Interim Report rated this church “S” (the early survey rating equivalent to “notable”). The church has been sided with vinyl siding, however, it meets the standards established by the Park Service for sided buildings and is in keeping with similarly sided buildings which the board has individually approved in the last ten years. National Park Service guidelines for sided buildings refer to retention of intent (siding on a masonry building is inherently inappropriate), mass, form, and design as well as moldings. Not only does the church retain most of its design intent, it retains significant interior spaces and details. Additionally, the applicant has provided a summarized list of similar properties to provide a context, in which Simpson Church is clearly architecturally significant. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers for its local significance under Criterion C (design).

2. Hillcrest Country Club, 049-295-00042, 6098 Fall Creek Rd., Indianapolis, Marion County (1758)

The 1994 Pike and Lawrence Townships, Marion County, Interim Report identified Hillcrest as “notable.” In 2000, the club remodeled the main clubhouse, placing an addition on the front as described in the nomination. Other changes have occurred over time to the facility’s buildings. The golf course has remained remarkably unchanged. In discussion with the Park Service, staff concluded that the property is eligible for the National Register under Criteria A and C, for its landscape architecture and entertainment / recreation significance, and not for its architecture. The overall integrity of the site, which is mostly a historic landscape, does in this case make the clubhouse a contributing building to the “district.” The applicant provides a national and local historical framework for evaluating the club, its golf course, and the well-known designer of the golf course. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers for its local significance under National Register Criteria A and C.

3. Goodland-Grant Township Public Library, 111 S. Newton St., Goodland, Newton County (1777)

There is no survey for Newton County, however, past staff visits to the community have confirmed the singular nature of this resource; it is the most prominent historic public building in the community. In cases like this, NPS guidelines call for the applicant to document the development of the resource, as is done here. The application also provides background on the development of public libraries in the county and in adjacent areas, to provide further context. Staff recommends approval of the application for the State and National Registers under Criteria A and C, local significance.

4. Hall School, 109-258-20009, 5955 W. Hurt Rd., Monrovia, Morgan County (1780)

The 1993 Morgan County Interim Report identified the Hall School as “contributing.” The recommendation was likely based on the architectural alterations (additions) made to the school, and not

on any research, judging from the survey form. The school does meet the standards for registration established in the "Indiana's Schools" Multiple Property Documentation Form (adopted in 1998). Specifically, the addition to the school leaves the historic portion of the school easily visible on the front and sides, indeed, nearly the entire mass of the school can be easily seen on all elevations. The historic portion of the school retains good integrity in its corridors and classrooms as stipulated in the MPDF registration standards. The application must include the entire building, since the NPS will not list portions of buildings. Built in 1911, Hall School is an early consolidated multi-room school and so represents a later phase of public education, unlike nearby Wilbur School (NR, 1993), the only one-room district school in Gregg Township that survives to any reasonable degree. Staff concurs with the applicant that the school meets Criteria A and C, for its locally outstanding architecture, and for its connection to the development of education in Morgan County. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers for its local significance.

5. Millen House, 105-055-80021, 112 N. Bryan Ave., Bloomington, Monroe County (1782)

The Millen House, a c.1845 in Bloomington, was rated "outstanding" in the 2004 City of Bloomington survey for its architectural significance and its role in the exploration/settlement of Bloomington. This Greek Revival/Georgian house is remarkably intact and currently houses the Office of American Historians Executive Headquarters. Staff recommends approval for both the State and National Registers as locally significant under Criteria A (exploration/settlement) and C (architecture).

6. Central Court Historic District, 098-296-04000, 3529-3575 Central Ct., 515-551 E. 36th Street, Indianapolis, Marion County (1785)

Central Court was identified as a district in the 1991 Center Township, Marion County Interim Report. Central Court is akin to a distinctive early twentieth century development trend, the bungalow court. The applicant makes a case for the significance of Central Court as a distinct development type, both in its uniformity of design and in its physical plan and financial arrangements. Staff recommends that the district be listed on the State and National Registers under Criteria A and C, local significance.

7. Louis J. Bailey Branch Library – Gary International Institute, 089-232-20577, 1501 W. Madison St. Gary, Lake County (1787)

This library was recommended as "Outstanding" in the 1996 Lake County Interim Report. Established in 1918, the library played a unique role in the ethnic heritage of Indiana. Rather than indoctrinating immigrants into American society, the International Institute housed at the library encouraged children and adults to identify and retain their native heritage. Staff is concerned with the degree of deterioration of the building. The building does retain significant interior and exterior features, sufficient, staff believes, to convey the mainly historical significance of the building. Staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers under Criteria A and C, statewide significance.